

15 Arguments against Plato's Republic

The following arguments have been advanced against 'The Republic' of Plato:

(1) Utopian Ideal

The ideal state of the Republic is Utopian. It cannot be applied to existing states. In fact no ideal of a state can be equally valid in all times and climes. As the ~~circumstances~~ circumstances change, so should change the idea of an ideal state.

(2) Applicable to small states

The optimum population of an ideal state, according to Plato, is 5040. It goes without saying that this cannot be applied to any existing state. It was applicable only to a city state which were small and self-sufficient.

"Just remember - when you think all is lost, the future remains." - Bovee

(3) Negligence of Law

By entrusting the ideal state to the Philosopher King, Plato neglected the value of the law. The order of the philosopher king was itself law. This cannot be accepted by the modern political scientists.

(4) Absolute power corrupts absolutely

By entrusting absolute power of the state in the hands of the Philosopher King, Plato made a scope for corruption. He forgot the psychological dictum that absolute power corrupts absolutely.

(5) Separation of Political and Economic Power

In the modern states the political and economic powers go together. As the state cannot achieve its aims without economic power, Plato in his book Republic, kept the rulers free from economic powers. It is difficult to understand as to how could they effectively use their political power.

"No enemy is so terrible as a man of genius." - Benjamin Disraeli

18 in the absence of economic power.

(6) Negligence of Lower Class

Plato, in his republic, did not give any political right to the servants. Deprivation of the lower class of all political advantages is against the theory of justice. No modern political scientist can agree to the deprivation of political rights to a sizable section of society.

(7) Anti-Republic / Democracy

Platonic ideal of state is anti-democracy while democracy has been considered as the most ideal form of government by the modern political scientists almost unanimously.

(8) Impractical Communism

Plato's theory of communism of women and property for ruler classes is absolutely impractical and immoral.

"Genius only means an infinite capacity for taking pains." - Jane Hokin

